

Strategies and effectiveness analysis of modern marketing methods: a comparative study based on influencer marketing and traditional advertising marketing

Hongjie Liu*

The university of Manchester, Manchester, England, M13 9PL, UK

Abstract. This study examines the evolution of advertising from traditional media to social media platforms and analyzes how consumer engagement on different social media platforms impacts advertising effectiveness. Starting with advertising through print, then radio, TV, and later through digital channels, research traces back the historical development of advertising, focusing on unique characteristics of social media advertising. Through a comprehensive literature review of recent scholarly articles and industry reports, we investigate how platform-specific features and user experiences shape engagement with both social media content and embedded advertising. The study reveals engagement is highly context-specific; thus, each of the social media platforms provides a very particular set of experiences conditioning how users engage with and react to advertising content. When developing their social media marketing plans, advertisers should be sensitive to the differences between platforms in terms of the strategies applied for engagement. This paper concludes by providing a conceptual framework from which to think about the relationships between platform-specific engagement and the outcome of social media advertising. This research contributes to the increased volume of literature surrounding digital advertising and has practical implications for how marketers can maximize returns from their social media advertising activity in an increasingly fragmented, complex media environment.

1 Introduction

From simple newspaper adverts in the mid-19th century to complex and data-driven digital campaigns today, the advertising industry has undergone profound transformations since its inception in the mid-19th century. Due to the industrial revolution, mass production of goods became possible, which leads to the emergence of quality issues [1]. Consequently, manufacturers needed to advertise to highlight their unique features and achieve a 'scale effect' in promotion [1]. Above all, the mass media gave early advertisements a platform through the press. It wasn't until the 1920s, though, that radio really transformed advertising with the capability of allowing brands to speak to consumers for the first time directly in their

* Corresponding author: hongjie.liu@student.manchester.ac.uk

own homes. By the 1940s and 1950s, the emergence of television took the world of advertising to yet a new level, with agencies such as BBDO seeing huge potential in the medium from the very start [1].

Social media platforms, such as Facebook, Twitter, and Instagram, were in the market since the early 2000s. They were introduced as the tools for individuals to connect and share content online. Over time, these platforms have evolved to become powerful channels for businesses to engage with their audience. In the last couple of years, social media has been a very important avenue for advertising and brand engagement, radically changing how companies communicate with consumers. The rapid rise of social media has opened up unprecedented opportunities for advertisers to reach and engage audiences. Alghizzawi discussed, by the end of 2018, the volume of users connected to the internet had reached as high as 4.1 billion, out of which 92% access the internet from mobile devices [2]. The same study reported that there were 3.56 billion active social media users worldwide. This massive user base, combined with the ability to precisely target ads and track engagement metrics, has made social media an increasingly attractive option for advertisers.

The purpose of this research is to examine how consumer engagement with different social media platforms impacts the effectiveness of advertising on those platforms. Specifically, this study aims to analyze how the unique characteristics and usage patterns of platforms like Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, and Instagram create distinct contexts that shape users' experiences with and responses to advertising content. This research is important because it can aid marketers to further fine-tune their strategies on social media advertising by aligning the content and message with user engagement patterns across different platforms. Additionally, it provides greater depth to the literature on digital advertising in regard to the impact of context on advertising effectiveness in social media environments.

The research methodology involves a comprehensive literature review using Google Scholar to identify relevant peer-reviewed articles published primarily within the last 10 years. Key search terms included "social media advertising," "digital engagement," and "advertising effectiveness." This paper focused on highly cited papers (50+ citations) and paid particular attention to sections discussing theoretical frameworks, empirical findings, and practical implications. The literature review was supplemented by analysis of industry reports and case studies to incorporate current trends and real-world examples.

This study will start with a view of the historic evolution of advertising, tracing the shift from traditional to digital media. Next, an examination of the special characteristics of social media as an advertising channel, specifically in terms of its reach, targeting, and engagement metrics, will be presented. Then this study will analyze how consumer engagement differs across major social media platforms and discuss implications for advertising effectiveness. Finally, this study will synthesize key findings to develop a conceptual framework for understanding the relationship between platform-specific engagement and advertising outcomes on social media.

2 Historical evolution and key concepts of marketing strategies

2.1 The evolution of traditional advertising

The roots of modern advertising can be traced back to the mid-19th century, when it became entwined with both the industrial revolution and the rise of mass media. As Tungate notes, "Everyone agrees, then, that advertising got into its stride with the industrial revolution – aided and abetted by the rise of the newspaper as a mass medium." In this period, consumer goods production rose significantly [1]. As a consequence of this, manufacturers sought new markets for their products and began establishing brand identities.

The late 19th and early 20th centuries witnessed the emergence of pioneering people come into this arena of advertising. One such pioneer was Claude Hopkins. He believed that the only reason for advertising was to sell [1]. His philosophy of "dramatized salesmanship" and focus on unique selling propositions laid the groundwork for more modern techniques in advertising.

The advent of radio in the 1920s revolutionized advertising, giving advertisers an absolutely new medium to reach consumers directly into their homes. As Tungate explains, "In the United States, radio became the almost exclusive domain of advertisers, who sponsored and produced shows," giving advertisers an absolutely new medium with which to reach consumers directly into their homes [1].

Television's arrival in the 1940s and 1950s further transformed the advertising world. Agencies like BBDO quickly recognized TV's potential, with their TV department growing from 12 to 150 people between 1946 and 1949 [1].

By the 1950s, advertising had become a glamorous profession, together with their ethical concerns: the industry's growing influence gave rise to debates about consumer manipulation. As highlighted by Vance Packard's bestseller "The Hidden Persuaders" [1]. This tension between creativity and consumer psychology continues to shape advertising strategies today.

2.2 The emergence and growth of influencer marketing

Influencer marketing today began to take shape in the early 2000s, after bloggers and the first social media platforms came up in the industry [2]. However, it wasn't until the rise of Instagram in 2010, along with YouTube's partner program in 2007, that an influencer marketing concept really came to life. These platforms provided the tools for content creators to build up large followings effectively, followed by ways to monetize such influence.

Instagram, in particular, tremendously catalyzed the growth of influencer marketing. Its visual-centric approach allowed users to curate aesthetically pleasing feeds, attracting followers interested in lifestyle, fashion, and beauty content. As Joshi et al. mention, "Influencers first appeared in the early 2000s, and have since progressed from a home-based hobby to a lucrative full-time career" [3].

Furthermore, the rise of YouTube vloggers further catalyzed the influencer phenomenon. Content creators can now share more elaborate and personal content, allowing for closer connections to be formed with their audiences. In this respect, parasocial relationships were built in which followers feel a sense of intimacy with an influencer despite the one-way nature of the interaction [4].

Social media platforms recognized this power of influence marketing and began introducing features to facilitate brand collaborations. Sponsored post tags on Instagram and product placement disclosures on YouTube are exemplified in which these platforms adapted to the growing influencer economy.

By the mid-2010s, influencer marketing had become a significant industry. Joshi et al. state that "Influencer marketing has become so attractive that with the growing industry, there is an ever-growing set of social media users that aim to become an influencer" [3]. As a result of this growth, influencer marketing agencies and platforms specialized in this field started to develop, hence professionalizing the industry even further. As of 2023, there are an estimated 50 million people worldwide who consider themselves influencers, with around 2 million making a full-time career out of it [5]. Additionally, the number of individuals involved in online sales and marketing through social media platforms has surged, with a significant portion engaged in live streaming and online selling activities [6]. This exponential growth shows the increasing influence of social media in shaping modern advertising and brand engagement.

3 Traditional advertising and influencer marketing strategies

3.1 Traditional advertising strategies

Traditional advertising refers to the conventional methods that are used to promote products and services through various media channels. These conventional methods include television, radio, print media, and etc. One major goal of traditional advertising is the creation of messages and visuals that get audiences' attention and persuade them to take actions. For example, Leo Burnett, founder of the eponymous agency, went on to create iconic figures like the Marlboro Man and the Jolly Green Giant. These figures are now deeply integrated into the popular culture [1]. Another important aspect of traditional advertising is the creative application of media planning and buying to maximize reach and frequency. In other words, agencies like J. Walter Thompson developed sophisticated methods toward media placement, where the correct medium choice and quality of audience are leading drivers of campaign success [1].

Recent research by De Vries et al. confirms that traditional advertising is still very powerful, and in particular, the domains of establishing brand awareness and consideration remain very strong [7]. Their study indicated that, compared to other means of marketing communication, traditional advertising had the strongest influence on customer acquisition. As noted by the authors, "Traditional advertising's reach and the provided information seem to help consumers to make their final purchase decision" [7]. For example, Coca-Cola company had a "Share a Coke" campaign, which increased customers engagement and sales by personalizing bottles with popular names [8]. Also, Nike's long term "Just Do It" campaign continues to effectively motivate athletes around the world, and this ad was delivered through traditional media channels [9].

With the advent of digital technologies, many agencies have integrated traditional and digital nowadays to offer more holistic campaigns. We will discuss this in detail in the following section.

3.2 Influencer marketing strategies

Influencer marketing has emerged as a powerful strategy in the digital age, leveraging the reach and credibility of social media personalities to promote brands and products. According to Joshi et al., influencer marketing strategies typically involve collaborations between brands and social media influencers, where the latter act as brand ambassadors [3]. These influencers create sponsored content that integrates the brand's message with their personal lifestyle and experiences, sharing it through various social media platforms such as Instagram, YouTube, and TikTok.

A key aspect of influencer marketing strategies is the creation of authentic and relatable content. Venciute et al. highlight that the perceived authenticity and credibility of influencers are crucial factors in the effectiveness of these campaigns [10]. Successful strategies often involve influencers seamlessly incorporating branded messages into their regular content, maintaining a balance between promotional material and their usual posts to preserve authenticity.

Another important element is the selection of appropriate influencers. Brands typically seek influencers whose image and follower base align with their target audience. Joshi et al. note that influencers are categorized based on their follower count, ranging from nano-influencers with a few thousand followers to mega-influencers with millions [3]. Each category offers different benefits in terms of reach, engagement rates, and cost.

4 Differential analysis and impact on consumer behavior

4.1 Strength and weakness of traditional advertising

Traditional advertising has several key benefits. It covers a large audience—some brands can quickly communicate information to many audiences. As De Vries et al. note, "Traditional advertising is broadcasted over many different channels, which contributes to its large reach" [7]. This broad coverage helps build brand awareness efficiently. Additionally, traditional ads give marketers full control over messaging and creative execution. Tungate observes that agencies can craft ads with "taut, compelling copy" to hook consumers. This level of control enables consistent brand positioning [1].

Traditional advertising is also predictable in terms of media placement and audience exposure. Marketers can reliably estimate how many people will see an ad and how often. Specific advertisement placement locations can accurately target potential consumers and customers. There are, however, some drawbacks to traditional advertising. Specifically, high production and media costs could make it difficult to frequently run a television commercial or large print campaign. There may also be a certain amount of ad fatigue from repetitive messaging. As Tungate points out, some consumers have become "cynical" toward traditional advertising claims [1]. This skepticism can limit effectiveness, especially among younger audiences who prefer more authentic brand communications.

4.2 Strength and weakness of influencer marketing

Influencer marketing tends to drive high engagement, since influencers have spent years building up loyal followings who trust their opinions. Influencers can create authentic, organic content that resonates with their followers. Venciute et al. found that "influencers leverage their established relationship and the trust they have built with their followers," [10], which brands are able to cash in on through strong ties. Another reason is that influencer marketing tends to receive "more attention from consumers compared to brand-generated ads" [10]. This higher engagement can increase brand awareness and sales.

However, Jhawar et al. caution that the credibility of social media influencers has decreased. There are risks associated with influencer behavior - any missteps could reflect poorly on associated brands [4]. Measuring return on investment can be difficult, as noted by Venciute et al.: "it is difficult for companies to select influencers that their target audience feels congruent with" [10].

A significant downside to consider is the big data filters. Due to the big data features, the merchants can locate consumers preferences easier and carry out bombardment of publicity. Consequently, after purchasing certain product, consumers might find themselves repeatedly encountering similar information. In the study by Li et al., this scenario can have challenges for effective data utilization in various fields, such as marketing and manufacturing, where big data plays a crucial role [11].

4.3 Impact on consumer behavior

The digital landscape has significantly altered consumer behavior and purchase decision-making processes. According to Alghizzawi, there are 4.1 billion internet users worldwide, with 92% using a mobile phone to go online. The impact can also be seen in the tourism sector. Alghizzawi reports that 45% of connected travelers make their bookings from smartphones, while 34% use mobile devices for check-in purposes [2].

Traditional advertising still influences consumer perceptions to some extent. Krizanova et al. found that traditional advertising was most effective in creating awareness (elasticity of 0.024) and consideration (elasticity of 0.022) among consumers [12]. However, the study also revealed that 30.7% of the hotels do not evaluate at all the effectiveness of their online communication forms. This shows that there are still gaps in understanding digital marketing's impact. In contrast, influencer marketing through social media platforms appears to have a more direct impact on purchase decisions. Alghizzawi notes that more than 74% of tourists use the opinions of other travelers as a source of information when planning trips [2].

Another essential influencer marketing element is word-of-mouth (WOM). According to Alghizzawi, a 10% increase in electronic feedback can lead to a 5% increase in bookings and sales in the tourism sector [2]. Krizanova et al. also found that return on investment (ROI) was the most common metric (26.2% of respondents) used by hotels to evaluate the effectiveness of their online marketing efforts [12]. This shows that businesses are increasingly looking to quantify the direct impact of their digital marketing strategies on consumer behavior and sales.

5 Future trends and recommendations

As social media and digital marketing continue to evolve rapidly, several trends are likely to shape the future of this field:

First, given the growing attention towards privacy and protection of data, activities involving consumers will have to take alternative routes while being respectful of their privacy preferences. According to Dwivedi et al., one of the big challenges relevant in this context has to do with the so-called personalization-privacy paradox [13]. Marketers will have to figure out more transparent data practices and how to build trust with consumers [13].

The second is that new technologies, in particular augmented reality (AR) and artificial intelligence (AI), create novel ways for brands to interact with consumers. Especially in the case of the latter, AR offers exciting possibilities for immersive, interactive advertising experiences. [13]. But marketers should ensure that these technologies enhance rather than detract from the user experience.

Thirdly, there's likely to be a continued shift towards more integrated and omnichannel approaches. As Voorveld et al. demonstrate, experiences of engagement differ significantly across platforms [14]. While this means that marketers are going to have to tailor content for each platform, the brand message should be consistent.

Finally, purpose-driven marketing that aligns with social and environmental causes is likely to rise in prominence. Increasingly, consumers are expecting brands to stand for something meaningful. As Dahl et al. argue, there is potential for greater symbiosis between commercial marketing techniques and social marketing goals [15].

To succeed in this evolving landscape, this study recommends marketers to:

- 1) Make data privacy and transparency top priorities for gaining the trust of consumers.
- 2) Experiment with emerging technologies like AR but stay focused on user experience.
- 3) Develop platform-specific content strategies within an integrated omnichannel approach.
- 4) Ensure marketing is aligned with an authentic brand purpose and set of values.

6 Conclusion

In summary, this study sought to find out how the traditional advertising and influencer marketing strategies evolved and their effects. We found that traditional advertising remained a very potent force in creating brand awareness and brand consideration, but influencer

marketing builds more personal relationships using social media. Both approaches share fundamental concepts such as persuasion, storytelling, and audience targeting but are different in their execution and reach. We found that traditional advertising delivers broad reach and message control but has severe problems with ad fatigue and skepticism from youthful audiences. On the other hand, influencer marketing engenders high engagement through authentic content, but it also has to tackle problems of credibility and measurement of ROI. The digital landscape has significantly altered consumer behavior, with social media and mobile devices playing increasingly important roles in purchase decisions.

This study has some limitations, however. We relied primarily on existing literature and didn't conduct original empirical research. Additionally, the rapid pace of technological change in marketing may have outpaced some of our findings.

The future for researchers is to probe how AR and AI are going to reshape marketing strategies. We need to understand how marketers will offset the rising personalization against privacy concerns. Future research into how purpose-driven marketing and social causes ultimately influence consumer behaviors could be an important area to study. As the importance of brands supporting social and environmental issues has been growing recently, understanding the impact on consumer perceptions and purchasing decisions will be instrumental for developing more effective marketing strategies.

References

1. M. Tungate, *Adland: a global history of advertising*. Kogan Page Publishers (2007)
2. Alghizzawi, M., The role of digital marketing in consumer behavior: A survey. *Int. J. Inf. Technol. Lang. Stud.*, **3**, 24-31 (2019)
3. Y. Joshi, W.M. Lim, K. Jagani, S. Kumar, Social media influencer marketing: foundations, trends, and ways forward. *Electron. Commer. Res.*, 1-55 (2023)
4. A. Jhavar, P. Kumar, S. Varshney, The emergence of virtual influencers: a shift in the influencer marketing paradigm. *Young Consum.*, **24**, 468-484 (2023)
5. Influencer Marketing Hub, *The State of Influencer Marketing 2024: Benchmark Report*, Influencer Marketing Hub (2024), Available at: <https://influencermarketinghub.com/state-of-influencer-marketing-2024>
6. V. Dencheva, *Influencer marketing worldwide - statistics & facts*, Statista (2023) Available at: <https://statista.com/topics/2496/influence-marketing/>
7. L. De Vries, S. Gensler, P.S. Leeftang, Effects of traditional advertising and social messages on brand-building metrics and customer acquisition. *J. Mark.*, **81**, 1-15 (2017)
8. T. Muse, "Share a Coke": A Look Back at Coca-Cola's Iconic Campaign. *History Oasis* (2023), Available at: <https://historyoasis.com/post/share-a-coke>
9. B. Urvater, C. Vandegrift, Case Study: Nike & Colin Kaepernick "Just Do It" Campaign. *Comm 473: PR Campaigns*. Professor Renea Nichols (2021)
10. D. Venciute, I. Mackeviciene, M. Kuslys, R.F. Correia, The role of influencer-follower congruence in the relationship between influencer marketing and purchase behaviour. *J. Retail. Consum. Serv.*, **75**, 103506 (2023)
11. Y. Li, L. Wang, X. Chen, R. Jin, Distributed data filtering and modeling for fog and networked manufacturing. *IISE Trans.*, **56**, 485-496 (2024)
12. A. Krizanova, G. Lăzăroiu, L. Gajanova, J. Kliestikova, M. Nadanyiova, D. Moravcikova, The effectiveness of marketing communication and importance of its evaluation in an online environment. *Sustainability*, **11**, 7016 (2019)

13. Y.K. Dwivedi, E. Ismagilova, D.L. Hughes, J. Carlson, R. Filieri, J. Jacobson, V. Jain, H. Karjaluoto, H. Kefi, A.S. Krishen, V. Kumar, Setting the future of digital and social media marketing research: Perspectives and research propositions. *Int. J. Inf. Manag.*, **59**, 102168 (2021)
14. H.A. Voorveld, G. Van Noort, D.G. Muntinga, F. Bronner, Engagement with social media and social media advertising: The differentiating role of platform type. *J. Advert.*, **47**, 38-54 (2018)
15. S. Dahl, L. Eagle, D. Low, Integrated marketing communications and social marketing: Together for the common good?. *J. Soc. Mark.*, **5**, 226-240 (2015)